



OFFICE OF THE  
AUDITOR GENERAL OF PAKISTAN  
AUDIT HOUSE, CONSTITUTION AVENUE ISLAMABAD  
INTERNATIONAL RELATIONS AND COORDINATION WING

518 /118-DIR/IR-BidEvaluationCommittee/C

12 October 2020

Audit Officer (Admin-III)  
O/o Auditor General of Pakistan

Subject: **BID EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS  
I.R.O BID OF SECURITY SERVICES (TENDER REF NO: 45/ADMN-  
III/CT/2020-21)**

Reference is made to your office letter no. 45/Admn-III/CT/2019-20 dated 21 September 2020

2. Please find attached (Annexure-A) the Bid-Evaluation Report of Technical and Financial Aspects i.r.o Security Services (Tender Ref : 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21).

3. Sealed Financial bids / CDR of respective four bidders are attached in Envelope-1 as per the detail

M/s SANKO Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s AQSA Security Guards Pvt Ltd	M/s Brother Protection (Pvt), Ltd	M/s MPS Security Guards Services (pvt)
Ref No. 07037007. Dated 18-09-2020 for Rs.195,620/- Mezan Bank Limited	CDR No. 13027469 dated 17-09-2020 for Rs.185,036/- Allied Bank Limited	B.C. No.:5254320 , Dated 21-09-2020, For Rs.395,640/-, MCB Bank Limited	Pay Order No.02046412 dated 21-09-20, for Rs.225,000/-, Bank-Islami Pakistan Limited

4. Sealed Technical Bids of the respective bidders are attached in Envelope 1 and 2 respectively.  
5. Subject sealed bid documents [in original] and Attendance Sheet are returned for your consideration.  
6. This issues with the approval of Chairman Bid Evaluation Committee

  
(Muhammad Afnan Alam)  
Secy. Bid Evaluation Committee / Director  
IR&C Wing, OAGP

Copy (for information)

1. DAG Policy / Chairman Bid Evaluation Committee  
2. DG HRM/Member Bid Evaluation Committee

**EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES**  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

1. Bid Opening i.r.o Security Services (Tender Ref. No: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21) took place on 28 Sep 2020 in the presence of the following prospective bidders (Attendance Sheet attached as Annexure-A):
  - a. M/s SANKO Associates (Pvt) Ltd
  - b. M/s AQSA Security Guards Pvt Ltd
  - c. M/s Brother Protection (Pvt) Ltd
  - d. M/s MPS Security Guards Services (Pvt) Ltd
2. Financial bids submitted from the bidders are as follows:

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
Company Name	Earnest Money	01 Security Supervisor / month rate in PKR	Required 03 Security Supervisor or / month rate in PKR total	01 Security Guard / month rate in PKR	Required 27 Security Guard / month rate in PKR	Total (D+F)	Total G x 12 in PKR
M/s SANKO Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	195620	25790	77370	21285	574695	652065	7824780
M/s AQSA Security Guards Pvt Ltd	185036	21770	65310	20425	551475	616785	7401420
M/s Brother Protection (Pvt), Ltd	395640	18500	55500	17900	483300	538800	6465600
M/s MPS Security Guards Services (pvt) Ltd	225000	37333	112000	23777	641979	753979+ 61287 =815266	9783192

*Blank*  
*13/10/2020*

*Handwritten signature*

**EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES**  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

3. **Technical Evaluation:** Bids of the four bidders were evaluated against Section 1.5 (Eligibility and Qualification Criteria) and 1.6 (Documents comprising the document) and Section 2 (Instructions to bidders) of the bidding documents. The evaluation report against the two sections of the bidding document is as follows:

S. No	Requirement	M/s SANKO Associates (Pvt) Ltd.	M/s AQSA Security Guards Pvt Ltd	M/s Brother Protection (Pvt), Ltd	M/s MPS Security Guards Services (Pvt) Ltd
i.	Status of Non-Black-listed or Debarred (Affidavit on Stamp Paper)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes, but Affidavit does not have its issuance detail and dates. Original not provided
ii.	Active Tax Payer	Checked from Website. Present (as company)	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as company)	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as company)	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as Individual)
iii.	NTN & GTN Registered	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as company)	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as company)	Checked from FBR Website. Present (as company)	Registration No.3730211098243 Ref.No1310225-7 Mirza Abdul Razaq Baig. Individual
iv.	Vendor Number of AGPR	Yes - 30170193	Yes = L-09319 of 1997-98	30189170	<b>Not provided</b>
v.	Copies of Tax Registration Certificates	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
vi.	NOC issued by Ministry of Interior for rendering security services in Pakistan	Yes Chief Commissioner Islamabad dated 03.04.1998 on NOC of M/o Interior dated 19.03.1998 Whereas for 2020-21 is applied dated 27 Apr 2020 for renewal with Challan but no renewal grant is attached	Yes Interior Division no objection dated 23 Oct 1997, renewal for 2020-21 paid challan 22.07.2020 provided	Yes, NOC Issued by Min. of Interior U.O No. 4/60/06-S-III dated 12-02-2008.	Under process at Chief Commissioner Office, Islamabad dated 21 Sep. 2020 for fresh issuance
vii.	Documentary Evidence of at least 05 similar	List Provided with contact Nos as per	Copies of Agreements Provided	Auditor General of Pakistan 1 May 2017 to 30	Rawalpindi Institute of Cardiology since 16 May

*Shah*  
*27/05/2020*

**EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES**  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

	contracts, each of similar or high value completed during the last three years	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Following: Embassy of Kazakhstan since 01.10.2001 monthly bills received PKR 11,921,000</li> <li>NHA (HRTC) Burhan since 01.05.2016 monthly bills received PKR 613,250</li> <li>PEMRA G-8 since 01.04.2016 monthly bills received PKR 292,000</li> <li>M/o Science &amp; Technology since 01.01.2015 bills received PKR 510,993</li> <li>AGPR since 15.05.2016 monthly bills received PKR 431,586</li> <li>China Ghezouba since 01.01.2019 monthly bills received PKR 609,000</li> <li>Embassy of Italy since 01.01.2019 monthly bills received PKR 1,463,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>as per Following: PTA TO 01.07.2020</li> <li>30.06.2023 Engineering Development Board, Islamabad</li> <li>05.05.2020 to 04.05.2021</li> <li>Total Parco Pakistan Limited, Lahore 01.07.2020 to 30.06.2021</li> <li>Pakistan Tobacco Company Limited 01.02.2019 to 30.01.2020</li> <li>Fatima Jinnah University 15.02.2020 to 14.02.2021</li> <li>Biafo Industries Ltd 01.07.2018 to 30.06.2021</li> </ul>	April 2019	Bank of Azad Jammu and Kashmir 1 Jul 2018 to June 30, 19 and extended one-year wef. 1 Jul 2019	Regional Tax Office, Main Katcherhy Chowk, Rawalpindi w.e.f. 1 Sep 2020 to 31 Aug 2021.	Arshad Law Associates, Rawalpindi Since Nil Rs. Nil
viii.	Evidence of Registration since last 3 years or more, as "Security Service Provider" with Security Exchange Commission of Pakistan	Yes with SECP as SANKO Associates Pvt Ltd on 08.01.1998	Yes with SECP 14.11.1997	Letter No.5/923/2017-IESSI-4411 dated 23 Feb 2017 from Office of the Commissioner ICT Employees Social Security Institution (IESSI), Islamabad.	Yes. Certificate of Incorporation by the Securities and Exchange Commission of Pakistan Identification No.0121436 date of issue 11 Jul 2018	Rawalpindi Institute of Cardiology since 16 May	
ix.	Certificate from the client in support of	PEMRA dated Nil for the period since 1 Apr 2016	PTA dated 01.10.2019 for last	Yes. State Life Insurance	Yes. State Life Insurance	Rawalpindi Institute of Cardiology since 16 May	

*Admn*  
*13/A*

*Handwritten signature*

**EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES**  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

	satisfactory performance during the last three years	Embassy of Kazakhstan dated 01.10.2014 Embassy of Uzbekistan dated 10.02.2002 Embassy of Turkmenistan dated 01.10.2014 for the period since 01.11.2005 Ambassador of the Holy See dated 08.09.2020 for last 20 years Embassy of Myanmar since 07.03.2018 for the period since Sep 2013 Embassy of Tunisia dated 08.10.2020 for the period since 01.04.2015	five years NBP HQ dated 01.10.2019 Faysal Bank dated Nil PCB, Lahore dated 02.08.2018 Total Parco Ltd dated 09.12.2016 PSO North dated 30.04.2015	Corporation of Pakistan dated 18 May 2020 Office of the Auditor General of Pakistan dated March 2020 Bank of Azad Jammu and Kashmir dated 18 May 2020 Pakistan institute of for Parliamentary Services. Federal Medical & Dental Coordination, Islamabad dated 23 Jul 2019	2019 to 30 June 2020. Arshad Law Associates, Rawalpindi Since Nil Rs. Nil Swedish Group of Collages, Chakwal since 15 Oct 2019 to 15 Jan 2020 Rs. Nil, Proactive Pakistan I.T. solutions and service provider, Rawalpindi, since Nil Rs. Nil
x.	Bid Security @2.5% per annum of quoted price in the shape of Pay Order/Demand Draft	Ref No. 07037007. Dated 18-09-2020 For Rs.195,620/-	CDR No. 13027469 dated 17-09-2020 for Rs.185,036/-	B.C. No.:5254320 Dated 21-09-2020 For Rs.395,640/-	Pay Order No.02046412 dated 21-09-20 for Rs.225,000/-
xi.	Power of Attorney by the Directors authorizing the signatory of the bidder to submit the bid	Power of Attorney by Chief Executive to Maj (R) Muhammad Ishaq General Manager for Tender Process of OAGP	Power of Attorney by Chief Executive on Stamp Paper to Mr Muhammad Saleem General Manager for security tender of OAGP	CEO North Signed the Bid Document submission.	CEO Mirza Abdul Razaq Baig signed the Bid Document submission.
xii.	Company's Profile, Name, Address, Phone, Fax, Email address and Contact person	SANKO Associates (Pvt) Ltd. 3 <sup>rd</sup> Floor, Yasin Plaza, Jinnah Avenue, Blue Area, Islamabad. Ph.0512344168/ 2344169 Fax:051-2344169 Maj. (R) Muhammad	AQSA Security Guards (Pvt) Ltd. House No. CB-179 Lane 4, Peshawar Road, Rawalpindi. Ph: 051-5490964/ 0346-1117451	Brother Protection (Pvt) Ltd. 45-A Mozang Road, Lahore Ph:0322-4443442, 0321-882692, 042-36315763 Fax: 042-36304820	MPS Security Guards Services (Pvt) Ltd. Office 3 first Floor Quaid Plaza Jawaa Chowk 1-9/4, Islamabad. Cell No 03435550500 Maj (R) Mirza Abdul

*Adnan*  
*HT*

*Yasir S.*

**EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES**  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

		Ishaq, General Manager	Fax: 051-5491077	Col.(R) Muhammad Mahroof, Chief Executive North 0321518748	Razzaq Baig, CEO, MPS.
Documents comprising the bid					
	Yes	Yes	Not Provided	Yes Partially	
xiii.	Covering letter agreeing to all terms and conditions of the Bid Document and bid validity period	Issued certification on covering letter that company agreeing to all terms and conditions of the Bid Document and bid validity period	Issued certification on covering letter that m/s Aqsa Security Pvt Ltd is an agreed with all terms and conditions mentioned in Tender Documents of OAGP.		Covering letter agreeing that technical proposal for 120 days dully completed in all respect
xiv.	All documents required in sub-para 1.5.1 of the Bid Document	Yes	Yes	Partially see Section 1.5 Eligible Bidders	Partially see Section 1.5 Eligible Bidders
xv.	Forms A & B duly filled in all respect, Signed and stamped	Only provided form A	Yes, Both Form A & B provided duly signed and stamped	Only provided form A	Only provided form A
xvi.	Copy of last audited financial Statement	Financial Statement for the year ended 30 June 2019	Financial Statement for the year ended 30 June 2019	Financial Statement for the year ended 30 June 2019	Not Provided
<b>Evaluation against Section 1.5,1.6 and 2 of the bidding documents</b>					
<b>Evaluation Comments</b>		M/S Sanko Associates are not complaint on the following: Quoted rates for services inclusive and exclusive of taxes (both documents provided)	M/S Aqsa (Pvt)Ltd is substantially responsive bidder to be considered for further evaluation	M/S Brothers are not complaint on the following: a. Quoted rates for services inclusive of taxes and exclusive of documents (both provided)	M/S MPS Security (Pvt) Ltd. is not complaint on the following: a. Company is not until date authorized by Ministry of Interior, Govt. of Pakistan for rendering services b. Has not provided audited financial

*Ahmed*  
*BAK*

*Handwritten signature*

EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

					statements c. Has not undertaken 5 contracts of similar nature /income during the last three years d. Bidder is registered with SECP since July 2018 which is less than 3 years as provided in the bidding document
--	--	--	--	--	---

4. Evaluation against Section 3.1 (h): M/S Aqsa (Pvt.) Ltd being substantially responsive bidder is further evaluated against the criteria

S. No	Criteria	M/s AQSA Security Guards Pvt Ltd	
i.	Annual Turn Over 50 Million	Revenue 895,222,248 of Y2019 Page-148	
ii.	Completed Contracts of Security Services during the last 5 years. 10 Contracts	Pages 169 to 174 A list of clients is provided	
iii.	Total Number of Security Supervisors Required 03 (each in uniform and main badge).	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)	
iv.	Total Number of Guards Required 27 (each in uniform and badge)	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)	
v.	03 Number of Shifts (8	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)	

*Handwritten signature and date:*  
2020

*Handwritten signature:*

EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

	hours)	
vi.	03 Security Supervisors in each shift	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
vii.	27 Guards in each shift	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
viii.	Qualification of Security Supervisors Rtd. Army JCO	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
ix.	Qualification of Security Guards Middle Pass	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
x.	Age of Security Supervisors 40 to 55 years	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
xi.	Age of Security Guards 25 to 50 year	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
xii.	Minimum experience of Security Guard 2 Years	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
xiii.	Minimum height of Security Guard proposed for the assignment 5' 6"	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
xiv.	Number of six guards required to be equipped with licensed semi-automatic shotgun (Prompt Action) with a minimum of ten rounds with each guard	Yes (quoted Yes at Annex-B of Tender Document)
xv.	Total Number of Licensed Arms	In Islamabad total arms possession overall in Pakistan is 1933Nos, and all Pakistan Licenses are 112Nos. In Islamabad 12 Bore P/A=35Nos 30 Bore= 5Nos

*Approved  
B/A 2020*

*Handwritten signature*



EVALUATION REPORT ON TECHNICAL AND FINANCIAL ASPECTS OF BID OF SECURITY SERVICES  
(TENDER REF NO: 45/Admn-III/CT/2020-21)

		05 copies of licenses are provided
xvi.	Total Nos. of defense personnel in guards in strength	Strength certificate on company's letterhead that Permanent staff is 154 and security guards are 3735 all over Pakistan and GB

5. Final evaluation:

- a. M/S Aqsa Security Guards (Pvt.) Limited Bid is the "most advantageous bid" after being found substantially responsive to the terms and conditions as set out in the bidding document @ yearly rate of Rs 74,01,420 (exclusive of taxes)
- b. M/S Sanko, Brothers and MPS Limited bids were not found "substantially responsive" in line with the terms and conditions as set out in the bidding document

  
(MUHAMMAD ARNAN ALAM)  
Secretary Bid Evaluation Committee / Director IR&C Wing OAGP

  
(MRS) RAHEELA SAAD)  
Member Bid Evaluation Committee / DG HRM OAGP

  
(LIAQAT ALI MEMONI)  
Chairperson Bid Evaluation Committee / DAG Policy OAGP